

BOOK REVIEW

The Nuclear Suppliers and Nonproliferation : International Policy Choices, edited by Rodney W. Jones, Cesare Marlini, Joseph F. Pilat and willium C. Potter, Published by Lexington Books, Massachusetts, 1985, pages 249 + xv, price not mentioned.

Since the programme of Atoms for peace was initiated by President Eisenhower in 1953, several technological changes have taken place in the field of nuclear power. In those days the USA dominated the civilian nuclear industry and nuclear supplies world-wide with its unrivaled technological edge over others. By the end of the 1960s and early 1970s, however, several industrial powers challenged the US domination over nuclear trade. Again with the onset of the 1980s a group of emerging suppliers, known as the Second-Tier Suppliers (STS), is gradually coming to the scene. Together with this expansion of nuclear suppliers, the earlier nonproliferation regime is facing growing challenges despite the fact that membership in the nuclear weapons club still remains confined to the big Five. The International Atomic Energy Agency (IAEA) safeguards and the Nuclear Nonproliferation Treaty (NPT) are still the pillars of the nonproliferation regime. Since 1970 when the NPT came into force, adherents to the Treaty have increased to 130 countries, of which 127 are non-nuclear weapon states (NNWS) and 3 nuclear weapon states (NWS), namely, UK, USA and USSR. But the Treaty which represents the present nonproliferation regime comes under criticism by some threshold and near-nuclear states, collectively known as the 'problem countries.' Under such a situation obtaining in the nuclear

field, several questions may be raised : Is the present somewhat uniform export policy of the industrial countries together with IAEA safeguards effective enough to ensure nonproliferation of weapons ? How a balance can be achieved between peaceful nuclear cooperation and nonproliferation ? To what extent do the STS countries pose a challenge to the civil nuclear market and nonproliferation regime ? What is the future of the NPT ? The book *The Nuclear Suppliers and Nonproliferation : International policy Choices*, edited by Rodney W. Jones *et al* is a searching attempt to explore these queries.

The book under review is the outcome of the proceedings of a Seminar on Nuclear Suppliers and Nuclear Nonproliferation which was held on 28-29 June 1984 in Washington D.C. under the auspices of the Georgetown University Centre for Strategic and International Studies. The book, in the word of one of the editors, examines the nuclear supply issues of the day and assesses their implications for NPT review conference. One of those issues—the role that 'emerging' or second-tier nuclear suppliers will play in nuclear commerce and nonproliferation—is a new phenomenon that is poorly understood and has received little scholarly attention(p.2).

The book is organised in six parts : 1) Theoretical perspectives on the nuclear supplier's dilemma ; 2) National policy perspectives on nuclear supply; 3) New nuclear suppliers: second-tier issues; 4) Government-industry cooperation on nuclear supply policy; 5) Nuclear supply issues for problem countries; and 6) NPT review and the future of nonproliferation, with a Conclusion at the end.

The first part contains three articles. William C. Potter brings out the issues of convergence between the USSR and the USA where cooperation between them is feasible. Such areas are—policy of nuclear exports, approach to the Treaty of Tlatelolco, the Third NPT review conference and the Test Ban Treaties. Charles N. Van Doren explores the limits and prospects of enhancing the nuclear supplier controls over proliferation. According to him, the most

outstanding issue is whether the acceptance by a recipient NNWS of international safeguards on all its nuclear activities should be made a condition of any new supply commitments and where a consensus still eludes supplies (p. 18). Richard Kennedy explains the positive approach of the current US Administration towards a reliable supply as an underpinning of the nonproliferation goal. But he emphasizes that reliability of supply implies obligations not only on the part of suppliers, but also on the part of recipients.

Part two of the book contains the national export policy perspectives of the advanced nuclear countries, such as, Japan, Canada, Italy, France and West Germany. Although there is a general consensus about the goal of nonproliferation, policy perspectives differ in some degrees. All of them subscribe to the London Nuclear Suppliers' Group Guidelines (NSG), but most of them are unwilling to go by them unilaterally. Keichi Oshima while explaining the position of Japan both as an importer and exporter of nuclear materials puts a 6-point proposal for nonproliferation which includes control of nuclear arms race, pledge by all the NWS of a no-first use of nuclear weapons against a NNWS and increasing cooperation and coordination in export policy among the suppliers. Mark J. Moher brings out the strong commercial interest of Canada as an exporter of uranium and reactors in world nuclear commerce. In the process he focuses on the policy guidelines of how such an abiding commercial interest can be reconciled with the goal of nonproliferation. Carlo Mancini and Giuseppe Maria Borga of Italy caution that the adoption of an excessively rigid supply policy toward non-NPT states could induce them to seek alternative channels of nuclear supplies or to adopt a "do it yourself" attitude, as has been in some cases. Bertrand Barre of France, which is a nuclear-weapon but non-NPT state points out that France does not require full-scope or comprehensive safeguards for her nuclear exports to non-NPT states, for she thinks that nuclear proliferation is more of a political than a technical problem. However, France tends to favour the export of less pro-

liferation-prone technology like Light-Water Reactors. Erwin Hackel points out Germany's position both as an importer of nuclear fuel and services and a leading exporter of nuclear reactors. West Germany wants to pursue nonproliferation goals not by denial, but through increasing global nuclear cooperation. Joseph F. Pilat while reflecting on the German, France and Japanese supply policies, from a US perspective points out that unlike the Germans or Japanese, the French have a military-strategic perception of the proliferation problem. He also considers the prospects of their cooperation with each other and with the US in efforts to forge a viable supply regime for the future.

Part three of the book is devoted to the problem for the nonproliferation regime posed by the emerging or second-tier suppliers (STS). These countries which include Argentina, Brazil, China, India, Israel, Pakistan, Romania, South Africa, Spain, South Korea, Taiwan and Yugoslavia form a diverse group. Some of them belong to the NAM, some to the Warsaw Pact and some to NATO. Among them Romania, South Korea, Taiwan and Yugoslavia are adherents to the NPT. Naturally their perspectives toward nuclear supply and nonproliferation also differ. But to what extent? And, is the STS a real challenge to the old suppliers? Ram R. Subramaniam while projecting an Indian viewpoint contends that overly restrictive and excessive political intrusion by the advanced suppliers towards and into the nuclear programmes of the developing countries are likely to exacerbate the proliferation problem. According to him, unless the discriminatory provisions of the NPT are removed, it would be difficult to evolve a system of cooperation between the STS and the present NSG. Randy J. Rydell points out the motivations of these countries behind their nuclear programmes, such as, pursuit of technological self-sufficiency and political prestige. But they in no way pose a challenge to the existing supply market due to their technological and financial constraints. Rydell further points out that an optimistic outcome from the proliferation of nuclear

regimes is the evolution of a quasi-federation of nonproliferation regimes, centred on a few basic understanding : the dangers of nuclear war, the national security implications for all nations of further proliferation, the subordination of commercial expediency to these national security priorities and a sustained commitment to meet legitimate energy needs through non-discriminatory access to peaceful nuclear technologies (p. 116). Lewis A. Dunn in his article contends that many of the same security considerations that led the original suppliers gradually to adopt more rigorous nuclear export standards are likely to influence their successors (p. 127).

The fourth part of the book focuses on the importance of industry-government cooperation on nuclear supply issues. Contribution by Francois Bujon de L'Estang of France reveals the striking structural contrasts between the closely cooperative French and the uneven relationship between US government and industrial firms over nuclear export issues and nonproliferation policy. US experience shows that the state of domestic nuclear industry can be a deciding factor in the success or failure of nonproliferation objectives. Dwight Porter, a former US Ambassador holds the view that the means by which the US nuclear industry can best support nonproliferation objectives is by continuing its technological leadership and maintaining its role as a major exporter of nuclear power plants and technology. But, the achievement of US nonproliferation goals and the health of the nuclear industry would be expected to mutually benefit if the latter were given a greater role in development and implementation of the government's nuclear export policy than it had in the past (p. 152).

Part five of the book focuses on the nuclear supply issues for the problem countries—countries that represent a problem for the nuclear nonproliferation regime which keep their option for nuclear weapons open. These countries are in most cases a source of concern for each other. Cesare Marlini proposes three policy approaches toward these countries : (1) strengthening the export policy cooperation among present suppliers ; (2) having new suppliers join present supplier

arrangements and (3) sticking to and improving the NPT and related business. Rodney W. Jones while analyzing the nuclear policy of India and Pakistan which are the nuclear-threshold and non-NPT countries, examines the degree to which they have been influenced by nuclear supply policies in the past and how these countries can be made amenable to nonproliferation objectives. However, both countries represent potential problems in the area of STS, the appropriate responses to which deserve much further study. Deniel Poneman in his contribution contends that since no Latin American country is self-sufficient in the nuclear field, suppliers have enough leverage in countries that rely on nuclear imports. In terms of indigenous nuclear capacity, Argentina proceeded much ahead of Brazil. Of late, in both countries, the intention of nonproliferation is more pronounced and Poneman puts a few suggestions to advanced suppliers including greater emphasis on the Treaty of Tlatelolco and promotion of stable government. Joseph A. Yager examines the nuclear development progress and proliferation incentives of South Korea and Taiwan, both parties to the NPT and brings out the reasons behind their subsequent disinterest in proliferation in the context of US diplomatic and security commitments towards both these countries.

The last part of the book is devoted to the Third NPT review conference and the future of nonproliferation. Mohammed I. Shaker, the President-designate of the 1985 NPT review conference predicts that some consensus on nuclear disarmament by the superpowers would be the major issue there. He is of the opinion that establishment of nuclear weapon-free zones along the line of Tlatelolco Treaty would bolster the nonproliferation regime. Linda Gallini along with discussing the likely issues for the NPT review conference dwells on US approach to strengthening the NPT institutionally and politically. Sergey I. Kislyak, a Soviet diplomat, while projecting his country's commitment to IAEA safeguards and NPT to strengthen the nonproliferation regime, suggests that the positive result achieved in preventing nuclear proliferation strengthen and

supplement efforts at reversing the nuclear arms race. Therefore, attempts to represent progress in one area as a precondition of progress in another can only make the entire process more difficult. Joseph Nye, a US arms control expert surveys the nonproliferation successes so far and with an air of optimism speculates about the best courses for further strengthening the nonproliferation regime. Myron Kratzer, also a former US nonproliferation official suggests a 7-point programme for re-ordering US nonproliferation policy which, among others, include security of supply, stability and continuity in policy goals and effective sanctions.

Finally, the editors of the book present the highlights of the conference discussions in the form of a Conclusion. They note that nuclear proliferation ultimately is a political problem, not one susceptible exclusively to technical measures. Nonproliferation policies depend for effectiveness on a wide range of means from diplomacy to security assistance on the one hand, and from safeguards and supply policy to sanctions on the other.

Although the essays collected in this volume do not cover the full range of nonproliferation policy means, but insofar as the suppliers and their nuclear cooperation policies have been at the center of the international regime for peaceful nuclear cooperation, the emphasis on supplier policy issues is quite logical and natural. The central issue of the existing supply regime is how to strike a balance between the commercial interests and nonproliferation goals. The addition of the emerging suppliers comprising a widely disparate group of countries further complicates the situation. Besides, there is no tangible progress in nuclear arms control between the superpowers. Articles 4 and 6 of the NPT stipulating peaceful nuclear cooperation and nuclear disarmament have been always at the focus of nuclear debate. All these delicate and complex issues have been well dealt with in the book under review by the eminent specialists in the nuclear field.

By this time, the Third NPT review conference already took place in September 1985 in Geneva. The states parties to the Treaty

adopted by consensus a Final Declaration in which, among others, they solemnly declared their conviction that the Treaty was essential to international peace and security and their continued support for the objectives of the Treaty. The conference reiterated that the implementation of Article 6 was essential to the maintenance and strengthening of the Treaty. It also regarded the establishment of nuclear-weapons free zones as an important disarmament measure. Thus, many of the conjectures about the review conference made by the contributors of the book came true.

As a matter of fact, the rules of nonproliferation so far worked well in an unequal world. But this should not be a matter of complacency for long, because the accumulation of weapons of mass destruction still dominates the security notion of individual nations. As long as nuclear threat exists against individual nations, the problem of proliferation will remain. Therefore, whatever might be the NSG guidelines or IAEA safeguards, the proliferation problem will essentially remain a political one. In this context, two actions are likely to be most effective in arresting the problems of proliferation : (a) a pledge by all the NWS not to attack a NNWS and (b) the NWS should urgently negotiate for a Comprehensive Test Ban Treaty leading to the complete cessation of testing, production and deployment of nuclear weapons. The world efforts should be directed towards achieving these goals.

However, as the nuclear issue is a burning topic in today's global politics both for its development and destruction potential, the present book with a scholarly treatment of the subject covering a wide range of interrelated issues, would greatly help the policy-makers, specialists and academicians alike to deal with the problem of nuclear proliferation.

Mizanur Rahman Khan

Bangladesh Institute of International
and Strategic Studies.